IETF Trust Call at 10:00 AM EST, Thursday, 3 December, 2009

Participants:

Lynn St. Amour   [Present]

Fred Baker   [Present]

Marshall Eubanks, Chair [Present]

Bob Hinden   [Present]

Russ Housley   [Present]

Ole Jacobsen   [Present]

Olaf Kolkman   [Present]

Ray Pelletier   [Present]

Henk Uijterwaal   [Present]

Jorge Contreras: [Guest, Legal Counsel]

Jewellee Dalrymple   [Scribe]

Trust Agenda

1. TLP 3.3

2. Debian Request for Grant of Additional Permissions

The Trust Meeting was called to order by the Chair at 10:03 AM.

1. TLP 3.3

The Trustees will have to review the TLP because there are various streams and an improper document error where the BSD license is mentioned in the boilerplate in a way that doesn't apply to non-IETF documents. There are two solutions: one is a patch - add to boilerplate that this might not apply to all documents - although we're patching this document too much as it is.

Secondly, and a better idea, is that we have two boilerplates at section 6. We've received responses from the tools team on that idea, and they're positive about this solution too. They suggest that this should apply to all documents going forward after 1 February.

The RFC Editor can fix the boilerplate so that it won't hold up the documents that are currently in the queue. A question is whether the document needs another 30-day review.

Looking at the document on screen there are three proposed areas for change: first is the title of the document, second is the text at Section 6 Intro and 6.b boilerplate of the document and third are the changes to the titles of the sections.

Clearly the first and third issues are just editorial changes.

It was decided that the first and third proposed changes did not have to be done at this time and could be considered later.

The one substantive change is in the boilerplate for the Alternate Streams, section 6.b.ii. Section 6.b.ii is an additional legend for Alternate Stream documents and copyright notices.

ii. Alternate Stream Documents Copyright and License Notice. In all Alternate Stream Documents (including RFCs and Internet-Drafts):

Copyright (c) <insert year> IETF Trust and the persons identified as the document authors. All rights reserved.

This document is subject to BCP 78 and the IETF Trust's Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info) in effect on the date of publication of this document. Please review these documents carefully, as they describe your rights and restrictions with respect to this document.

The only difference between 6.b.ii and 6.b.i, is that 6.b.i has an additional sentence regarding Code Components:

Code Components extracted from this document must include Simplified BSD License text as described in Section 4.e of the Trust Legal Provisions and are provided without warranty as described in the Simplified BSD License.

The only change to 6.b.i is its reformatting as 6.b.i.

Marshall suggested the Trust only make the 6.b.ii change. All the rest should not be touched - including the title of the document, because the Trust will end up rewriting the whole thing. Olaf agreed and suggested the Trust makes sure it gets the TLP out and commits itself to trying to get a more clean sense of the language from scratch in a new document in the future.

Not hearing any objections, Ray suggested proceeding with the change only to section 6.b.ii and the reformatting for 6.b.i.

RESOLUTION: Whereas the community has identified the need for technical (editorial) changes to section 6 of the TLP entitled "Text to be Included in IETF Documents" to not require code components to include the Simplified BSD License for the Alternate Stream.

Resolved that the IETF Trust adopts section 6.b.ii Alternate Stream Documents Copyright and License Notice, and the formatting change to 6.b.i.

Be it Further Resolved that the "Trust-Legal-Provisions-12-03-09.doc" shall be provided to the community for review during the current review period.

A motion to approve the resolutions was made by Marshall. The motion was seconded by Henk.

Not hearing any more discussion, a roll call vote was taken:

Lynn: [Yes]

Bob: [Yes]

Henk: [Yes]

Fred: [Yes]

Marshall: [Yes]

Olaf: [Yes]

Ole: [Yes]

Russ: [Yes]

Ray: [Yes]

The motion passes. Unanimous vote, all present.

2. Debian Request for Grant of Additional Permissions

Trust Counsel said that the legends are in the TLP, and the TLP is not
technically an IETF document because the TLP didn't exist at the time and no
one anticipated it would so the legends are not in an IETF document. To put
them in code you need the rights to do that. If the legends were an Internet
draft then we'd be able to take the language out and distribute under the
license. The Trust doesn't have a document that says you can reproduce and
distribute the TLP language, so what they wanted to do was have the Trust
designate that the language was code and should be treated as code and be
distributed under the BSD license. This is a result everyone wants. We could
modify the TLP or give permission to Debian to do what they want to do in a
note. There are several ways to do it. There's no reason not to say in
general that all IETF documents are IETF documents. The definition of 5378 is
historical.

Olaf proposed a blanket statement about using the license text in any piece
of code, and that would be sufficient for the Debian guys and anyone else as
it's not overly wide.

Trust Counsel noted that Debian is hypersensitive to these open source
issues. The Trust doesn't want them to change the legends, but we can't make
a restriction because that wouldn't follow the BSD license. From a copyright
standpoint, you have to allow them to distribute and modify the legends if
they want to, but it would violate IETF policy. If they create a document
that has a modified legend then it's not qualified as an IETF document and
from a copyright standpoint it would be tough to enforce changes in the

legend anyway. If they modify the text and send it in; the Trust just rejects it. The easiest thing to do would be to either grant Debian a license under the BSD license or give a generic license to everyone on the website. Counsel will create a note and send it around.

Bob suggested getting feedback from Debian before putting a lot of work into it. Jorge asked if the Trust is doing this just for the Debian group or for anyone and everyone. Bob said anyone, because there are other tools being developed. Marshall agreed saying the Trust is going to give anyone permission to do this.

Not hearing any other business for the Trust a motion to adjourn the IETF Trust meeting was made by Marshall. The motion was seconded by Henk. The motion passed unanimously and the IETF Trust meeting was adjourned at 10:47 AM.